

APPENDIX A

Document No.	Sealed Dkt. No.	Public Dkt. No.	Detailed Document Description	Designating Party	Court's Initial Determination	Court's Subsequent Determination
JOINT SUBMISSION SEEKING CLARIFICATION						
31	462	-	Handeyside Exhibit E - Siskin Responsive Expert Report (Oct. 2020)	Defendants	Can be filed publicly except for the redactions on page 37 (specific fields).	Defendants' proposed redactions to pages 36, 68, and 69 are approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 16.
75	472-1		Pasquarella Ex. 10 - Lombardi Deposition Excerpt	Defendants	Proposed redactions approved only as to pages 9-10, as they are limited and involve specific application.	Defendants' proposed redaction to page 8 is approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 16.
150	548		Pasquarella Ex. 108 - Johansen-Mendez Expert Report	Defendants	Paragraphs 31, 33, 90-91, and first portion of 92 (specific indicators) and paragraphs 69-73 (except for the last redline in paragraph 72), 78-80, 89 (specific applications) may be redacted. However, information about CARRP mechanics should not be redacted, e.g., paragraphs 36, 38, 51, final portion of 92, and 95-96. In addition, statistical data does not need to be redacted in paragraph 39, nor does generalized information in paragraph 84.	The Court affirms its original determination. See Dkt. No. 626 at 16.
165	515-2		Evans Ex. 12 - "Studies in National Security, Articulate Link Writing 101"	Defendants	Can be filed publicly (see Order).	Defendants' proposed redactions are approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 16.
MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION						
1	HSD	595-1	Plfs' Brief in support of Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
3	HSD	-	Pasquarella Ex. 074 - Excerpts from A-file of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Named Plaintiffs do not need to be redacted unless it is a specific, granular explanation of CARRP in relation to them. Internal mechanics of CARRP, e.g., in paragraph 80, do not need to be redacted because they are highly generalized. Other paragraphs, e.g. paragraphs 81, 98, 100, 132, 133, 182 can be redacted as they discuss specific indicators or resources. Form N-400 worksheet can be redacted in whole. Exhibits D, E, G appear to be individualized applications of CARRP and may be filed under seal. See Dkt. No. 274 at 5-6.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
12	HSD	-	Pasquarella Ex. 088, Bajoghli Expert Report	Defendants	Proposed redaction in paragraph 12 is approved as it constitutes a individualized explanation of an application of CARRP.	Proposed redaction highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
13	HSD	-	Pasquarella Ex. 089 - Ragland Expert Report	Defendants	Named Plaintiffs do not need to be redacted unless it is a specific, granular explanation of CARRP in relation to them. Internal mechanics of CARRP, e.g., in paragraphs 69, 71-72, 114-15, do not need to be redacted because they are highly generalized. However, the second half of paragraph 70 can be redacted as it reflects specific indicators, and paragraphs 74-82, 84-103, 123, 133 can be redacted because they reflect a specific application. The first redaction in paragraph 122 is overruled for failure to establish a valid concern; the second redaction may remain due to concerns regarding interagency communication and cooperation. Paragraph 136 and footnote 1 do not need to be redacted because they are highly generalized and Defendants have not established a valid concern. Exhibit C may not be redacted for failure to establish a valid concern.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
14	HSD	595-3	3d Declaration of Jennie Pasquarella	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved except as to first proposed redaction in Paragraph 5. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
15	HSD	595-4	Plfs' Reply in support of Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.

16	HSD	595-2	Def's Opposition and Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
17	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 2 - Quinn 30(b)(6) Deposition Excerpt (Sept. 3, 2020)	Defendants	Defendants fail to establish valid concerns regarding all redactions except for page 4 line 18 to page 6 line 11, and except for reference to named Plaintiffs in the context of a specific, granular explanation of CARRP in relation to them.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved as to pages 6 and 11 only. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
18	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 21 - Excerpts from A-file of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Defendants have failed to establish a valid concern; can be filed publicly but with any necessary redactions under LCR 5.2(a), including photos.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
19	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 23 - Excerpts from A-file of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Defendants have failed to establish a valid concern; can be filed publicly but with any necessary redactions under LCR 5.2(a), including photos.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
20	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 24 - Excerpts from A-file of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Defendants have failed to establish a valid concern; can be filed publicly but with any necessary redactions under LCR 5.2(a), including photos.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
21	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 27 - Excerpts from A-file of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Does not constitute application of CARRP and Defendants otherwise fail to establish a valid concern; can be filed publicly but with any necessary redactions under LCR 5.2(a), including photos.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
22	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 28 - Excerpts from A-file of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Does not constitute application of CARRP and Defendants otherwise fail to establish a valid concern; can be filed publicly but with any necessary redactions under LCR 5.2(a), including photos.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
23	HSD	-	Busen Ex. 29 - Excerpts from A-files of a Named Plaintiff	Defendants	Does not constitute application of CARRP and Defendants otherwise fail to establish a valid concern; can be filed publicly but with any necessary redactions under LCR 5.2(a), including photos.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
25	HSD	595-5	Def's Reply in support of Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions highlighted in red approved only as to Page 6 lines 8, 22, and n.2, and Page 7. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15.
DEFERRED DOCUMENTS						
1	HSD	595-1	Plfs' Brief in support of Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions approved other than: (1) Pages 21, lines 18-21 and n. 6, and Page 59 at lines 19-20, because these portions do not reveal discrete "country-specific data" or "law enforcement sensitive national security indicators," see Dkt. No. 626 at 16; and (2) Page 59 at lines 23-24 because this is not "granular" or specific guidance, see Dkt. No. 626 at 16-17.
14	HSD	595-3	3d Declaration of Jennie Pasquarella	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redaction to paragraph 7 approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-17.
15	HSD	595-4	Plfs' Reply in support of Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-17.
16	HSD	595-2	Def's Opposition and Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 16-17.
25	HSD	595-5	Def's Reply in support of Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	The Court has not identified proposed redactions apart from those included as part of Defendants' motion for reconsideration and decided above.

46	493	490	Plfs' Opposition to Motion to Exclude Kruskol	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 16-17.
104	472-3		Pasquarella Ex. 39 - CARRP training slides, "Identifying and Documenting NS Concerns (updated December 2017)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except (1) the slide number and agency logo on PDF pages 45 and 71; (2) the slide number on PDF page 60; and (3) the "confidential" footer on PDF page 101. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
107	472-4		Pasquarella Ex. 42 - CARRP training slides (updated June 2017)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except (1) the "confidential" footer on PDF pages 101, 105, 117; (2) the first parenthetical on pages 42-43, which was not included in Document Number 101 at page 95, and which Defendants do not seek to redact in Document Number 137 at 42-53; and (3) the proposed redaction on page 199 which is not redacted in Document Number 104 at PDF page 102.
108	472-4		Pasquarella Ex. 43 - National Security Indicator Training slides (updated August 2017)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except (1) the "unclassified" footer on PDF pages 61, 168, 175; (2) the "confidential" footer on PDF pages 77, 101; (3) the top half of page 119, which is not the same as the other document Defendants cite (Document Number 86 at 13), and not redacted in Document Number 101 at 148; and (4) the proposed redactions on PDF pages 118 and 119, which are not redacted in Document Number 104 at PDF page 59 or Document Number 137 at PDF page 116. See Dkt. No. 645-55 at 148-49.
109	472-5		Pasquarella Ex. 44 - CARRP Training Program, Module 6: Review and Test Prep training slides (updated September 2020)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except (1) page 11 which is not redacted to the same extent in Document Number 115 at PDF page 14 or Document Number 134 at PDF page 2 or Document Number 140 at PDF page 15; and (2) the "confidential" footer on PDF page 33. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
110	472-5		Pasquarella Ex. 45 - "National Background Identify and Security Checks Operating Procedures" (August 10, 2020)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
112	472-5		Pasquarella Ex. 47 - "Cross-Section Analysis of Controlled Application Review and Resolution Program" (April 10, 2015)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved other than page 9, which is not granular guidance. Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.

113	472-5		Pasquarella Ex. 48 - CARRP training slides, Module 3: CARRP Overview (updated Dec. 2015)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except the first redaction on PDF page 103 and the redactions on PDF page 104 because they are not redacted in Document Number 120 at PDF page 186. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
115	472-5		Pasquarella Ex. 50 - "CARRP Identification of an NS Concern" training slides	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16. The Court further notes that a redaction appears mistakenly omitted on page 71; the same information may be redacted from that page.
116	472-6		Pasquarella Ex. 51 - CARRP Adjudicator Training - Instructor Guide (updated December 2008)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
119	472-6		Pasquarella Ex. 54 - FDNS-DS User Guide Updates and Articulate Link Training	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
120	472-6		Pasquarella Ex. 55 - CARRP training slides (updated January 2014)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
123	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 58 - USCIS "Basic, Course 235, National Security" - Participant Guide	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
124	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 59 - FDNS Officer Basic Training, Identification of a NS Concerns training slides	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
126	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 61 - FDNS Officer Basic Training, National Security - Instructor Guide	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved other than top two redacted lines on page 43, which are not granular guidance and do not reflect how USCIS evaluates factual scenarios. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
128	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 63 - "National Security Overview and CARRP Processing" training slides (dated Oct. 29, 2015)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
129	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 64 - CARRP training slides, Module 3: CARRP Overview (updated Dec. 2015)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
130	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 65 - CARRP training slides, Module 4: Identifying and Documenting NS concerns (updated Dec. 2015)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
132	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 67 - CARRP, Phase II: Documenting Work in FDNS-DS training slides	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
134	472-7		Pasquarella Ex. 69 - "Senior Official CARRP Overview (Section II)" training notes	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.

137	472-8		Pasquarella Ex. 73 - CARRP training slides, Module 4: Identifying and Documenting NS Concerns (updated June 2017)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except the proposed redactions on PDF pages 190 and 191 because that content is not redacted in Document Number 107 at PDF pages 190 and 191. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
140	472-8		Pasquarella Ex. 90 - CARRP Identifying and Documenting NS Concerns training slides	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
142	472-8		Pasquarella Ex. 93 - "Structural Framework for Determining an Articulate Link to National Security Concerns"	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
148	548		Pasquarella Ex. 105 - CARRP training slides, Module 5: Determining Eligibility and Vetting National Security Concerns (updated December 2015)	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
149	548		Pasquarella Ex. 106 - CARRP training test questions and answer key	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
158	515-1		Evans Ex. 4 - 2020 CARRP Training Module 2	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved except the first half page of redactions on PDF page 78 because that content is not redacted in Document Number 113 at PDF page 99 or in Document 120 at PDF page 184. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
159	515-1		Evans Ex. 5 - 2020 CARRP Training Module 3	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
160	515-2		Evans Ex. 7 - 2017 CARRP Training Module 5	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
161	515-2		Evans Ex. 8 - 2017 CARRP Training, Determining Eligibility & Vetting NS Concerns	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved other than pages 32-34, which is not granular guidance and does not reflect how USCIS evaluates factual scenarios. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
166	515-3		Evans Ex. 14 - 2020 CARRP Training Module 5	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
168	515-5		Evans Ex. 19 - 2020 CARRP Training Module 4	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved other than pages 36-37, which is not granular guidance and does not reflect how USCIS evaluates factual scenarios. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
170	516-1		Evans Ex. 35 - Fact Sheet with Frequently Asked Questions regarding CARRP Policy and Operational Guidance	Defendants	Deferred; Defendants must either consent to publication or propose specific redactions.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.
179	519	526	Relph Declaration		Deferred; Defendants to provide version of document with proposed redactions highlighted so Court can efficiently identify portions proposed for redaction.	Proposed redactions approved. See Dkt. No. 626 at 15-16.