

[REDACTED]

From: 3, 6
Sent: Monday, October 04, 2010 4:20 PM
To: 3, 6 O'Reilly, Thomas
Cc: 3, 6
Subject: RE: NYT - Privacy & SAR - Critical of eGuardian

Thanks -- that's very interesting.

I don't believe I've met the author of the original OpEd, and I know he's not in the Federal Government (that I'm aware of). (b) (5)

[REDACTED]. This illustrates why quite nicely....

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

I think PM-ISE specifically, and DOJ and DHS more broadly, have done a great job with outreach in this area - just speaking in general terms....

From: Kshemendra N Paul
Sent: Monday, October 04, 2010 3:47 PM
To: thomas.o'reilly2; Alexander W Joel
Cc: b(3), (b) (6)
Subject: FW: NYT - Privacy & SAR - Critical of eGuardian

http://www.nytimes.com/2010/10/04/opinion/104intel.html?_r=1&ref=opinion

To the Editor:

John Farmer Jr. suggests that the American Civil Liberties Union's concerns about the Suspicious Activity Reporting (SAR) programs as a potential threat to civil liberties are inconsistent with my praise of last year's improvements to the Information Sharing Environment (ISE) guidelines. They are not.

The A.C.L.U. has been voicing concern about SAR programs to lawmakers and government agencies and advocating for stronger civil liberties protections for years. Moreover, while the improvements to the ISE guidelines were welcome, they apply only to that particular program; it remains far from clear whether other SAR programs, like the F.B.I.'s eGuardian system, will follow those standards. One good SAR policy is only a first step and solves only part of the problem.

While there is little evidence SAR programs find terrorists, there is plenty of evidence that they are being used to violate the rights of innocent people engaged in innocuous activities like photographing national landmarks and engaging in protected speech.

Collecting information about innocent Americans will not make us safer. Law enforcement already has the authority it needs to fight crime and terrorism without sacrificing the rights of those it seeks to protect.

Michael German

Washington, Sept. 28, 2010