## Exhibit A

4a

## APPENDIX B

## CERTIFICATION OF THE SECRETARY OF DEFENSE

This certification pertains to a collection of photographs (as that term is defined in Section 565(c)(2) of the Department of Homeland Security Appropriations Act, 2010 (Pub. L. 111-83) ("DHS Appropriations Act")) assembled by the Department of Defense that were taken in the period between September 11, 2001 and January 22, 2009, and that relate to the treatment of individuals engaged, captured or detained after September 11, 2001 by the Armed Forces of the United States in operations outside the United States. These photographs are contained in, or derived from, records of investigations of allegations of detainee abuse, including the records of investigation processed and released in American Civil Liberties Union v. Department of Defense, 04 Civ. 4151 (AKH) (S.D.N.Y.). The photographs include but are not limited to the 44 photographs referred to in the decision of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit in American Civil Liberties Union v. Department of Defense, 543 F.3d 59, 65 & n.2 (2d Cir. 2008), petition for cert. filed, 78 U.S.L.W. 3083 (Aug. 7, 2009) (No. 09-160).

Upon the recommendations of the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, the Commander of U.S. Central Command, and the Commander of Multi-National Forces-Iraq, and by the authority vested in me under Section 565(d)(1) of the DHS Appropriations Act, I have determined that public disclosure of these photographs would endanger citizens of the United States, members of the United States Armed Forces, or employees of the

5a

United States Government deployed outside the United States.

Therefore, these photographs meet the standard for protected documents, as that term is defined in section 565(c)(1) of the DHS Appropriations Act and are exempt from disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C § 552, and in all proceedings pursuant to that law. As required by Section 565(d)(4) of the DHS Appropriations Act, I hereby direct that notice of this Certification be provided to Congress.

Date: 11/13/09 /s/ ROBERT M. GATES Secretary of Defense